

Hierarchical Rubric

Combining the “rubrics” that GAAWG brainstormed during Fall 2013 with the hierarchy of learning developed at our 12/3/13 meeting. Essentially that hierarchy is a shorter version of Bloom’s taxonomy. I’m pulling the content descriptions from the rubrics and sorting them among the levels.

Critique

I thought after doing the first one that I would be able to do something comparable with the others. But I seemed to fall into a formulaic repetition of the language from the rubrics. There were some advantages to doing this: I separated the verbs applicable to each level of the hierarchy (“identify” and “describe” at the more basic levels, “describe,” “explain,” and “analyze” at the higher), and I added some ideas about historical development and contextual understanding to the descriptions in the second level. But it still seemed less successful than the work I did on the first outcome, perhaps because I’m more familiar with the relevant disciplines, their key terms and concepts.

Outcome 1

Recognize the value and significance of artistic and religious expressions in various world cultures.

Critique of outcome 1: Religious expression and artistic expression should not be combined in a single outcome.

Basic factual knowledge

Student work demonstrates basic factual knowledge required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level is *foundational or descriptive*, or answers the questions *who, what, where, and when*. It also includes terminology and definitions.

For example, the work:

- identifies and/or describes characteristic formal features of a given artistic genre;
- defines and/or correctly uses basic technical terms;
- identifies individuals, schools, movements important to a particular form or genre;
- identifies and/or describes representative works;
- identifies and/or describes characteristic forms of religious expression;
- identifies individuals, schools, movements important to a particular form of religious expression;
- identifies and/or describes representative documents, art works, ideas, or other expressions of a particular religious formation.

Contextual Knowledge and Understanding

Student work demonstrates contextual knowledge and understanding required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level includes understanding of basic historical, evolutionary, or developmental processes, simple relationships, levels of scale, and relative position.

For example, the work:

- describes the chronological development of a given form or genre;
- describes how different audiences might make use of and respond to a given art form in a particular culture;
- describes the range of meanings (ideological, philosophical, ethical, spiritual, and so on) typically associated with or manifested in a given art form in a particular culture;
- describes the relationship between individual works, genres, and larger cultural trends;
- compares and contrasts the significance of artistic expression in different societies and different time periods;
- describes the chronological development of particular forms of religious expression;
- describes how different audiences or groups make use of and respond to characteristic forms of religious expression in a particular culture;
- describes the range of meanings (social, ideological, philosophical, ethical, spiritual, and so on) typically associated with or manifested in characteristic forms of religious expression in a particular culture;
- describes relationships between individual practitioners, congregations or communities, and larger social formations;
- Compares and contrasts the significance of religious expression in different societies and different time periods.

Analysis

Student work analyzes complex phenomena and relationships that characterize this field of study.

Learning at this level includes understanding of complex processes and relationships, use of complex reasoning, and the ability to answer why and how questions.

For example, the work:

- analyzes characteristic formal features of a given art form, their components, and their relationships to each other;
- analyzes how formal properties of a work or genre create particular effects;
- analyzes the historical development of a given art form, including significant causes and effects of that development;
- analyzes the range of meanings typically associated with or manifested in a given art form, placing them in their appropriate contexts, and explaining how those different meanings are constituted both internally (as a function of the features of the work itself) and externally (by means of relationships to other symbolic systems, social structures, and cultural contexts);
- explains why different audiences might respond differently to, or find different uses for, particular works or forms;
- explores analogies to individual works, forms, genres, and trends in other contexts, both within the same culture and from other cultures;

- analyzes the relationship between individual works, genres, and larger cultural trends, including significant causes and effects (how individual works shape or transform genres; how genre or larger cultural patterns inform individual works);
- [the foregoing can easily be modified to apply to religious expression as well].

Synthesis and Integration

This is in progress—still needs work.

Student work synthesizes and integrates all the foregoing levels, from basic factual knowledge to complex analysis...

Learning at this level includes the ability to generate original insights and to produce new work in the field. This includes the production of new artistic work as well as the critical analysis of existing work.

For example, the work:

- integrates the formal features of a given genre or form of artistic expression in a coherent, original synthesis;
- produces new meanings through its formal features or its analysis of existing work;
- engages the historical context of its form or genre, or of the discourse of which it is a part;
- engages the contemporary context of its form or genre, or of the discourse of which it is a part, responding both to the work of individual practitioners and to broader trends or patterns;
- engages meaningfully with diverse audiences.

Outcome 2

Articulate the values and beliefs that influence humans in seeking identity and meaning within their culture.

Critique of outcome 2: There is a lot of overlap between this and the “religious expression” part of #1. At the same time, the phrase “values and beliefs” is pretty vague.

Basic Knowledge

Student work demonstrates basic factual knowledge required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level is *foundational or descriptive*, or answers the questions *who, what, where, and when*. It also includes terminology and definitions.

For example, the work:

- Defines and/or uses key terms associated with the analysis of values, beliefs, and identity;
- Identifies and describes particular beliefs or value systems that people in a particular culture use to shape identity and give meaning to their lives;
- Identifies various factors that contribute to shaping identity and creating meaning in human life, such as historical events, class structure, family dynamics, political systems, gender roles, artistic expression, etc.;

- Identifies representative questions, conflicts, or problems that arise with respect to particular values or beliefs in a particular culture, or in relation to issues of identity;
- Identifies the student's own value or belief systems and important elements in his or her sense of identity.

Contextual Knowledge and Understanding

Student work demonstrates contextual knowledge and understanding required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level includes understanding of basic historical, evolutionary, or developmental processes, simple relationships, levels of scale, and relative position.

For example, the work:

- describes how beliefs, values, and identities interact with other forces in a society, such as class structure, family dynamics, political systems, gender roles, artistic expression, etc.;
- describes the historical evolution of beliefs, values, and identities within a particular culture;
- describes representative questions, conflicts, or problems that arise with respect to particular values or beliefs, or in relation to issues of identity;
- describes the development of the student's own value or belief systems and sense of identity;
- describes the relationship between individual beliefs or values and sense of identity and those of progressively larger social groupings, including families, communities, polities, regions, and the globe.
- compares and contrasts the student's own value or belief systems and sense of identity with those of others;

Analysis

Student work analyzes complex phenomena and relationships that characterize this field of study.

Learning at this level includes understanding of complex processes and relationships, use of complex reasoning, and the ability to answer why and how questions.

For example, the work:

- analyzes how values and identity influence and are influenced by various factors, such as class structure, family dynamics, political systems, gender roles, artistic expression, etc.;
- analyzes the causes and effects of historical changes in values, beliefs, and identities;
- analyzes the structure of belief systems and systems of identity and explains how they contribute to creating meaning in human life;
- analyzes representative questions, conflicts, or problems that arise with respect to particular values or beliefs, or in relation to issues of identity;
- analyzes the relationships between individual beliefs and identities and those of progressively larger groups (families, communities, polities, regions, the globe);
- analyzes the relationships (historical connections, analogies, points of agreement and possible conflict, etc.) between the student's own beliefs and sense of identity, and those of others.

Synthesis and Integration

This is in progress—still needs work.

Student work synthesizes and integrates all the foregoing levels, from basic factual knowledge to complex analysis...

Learning at this level includes the ability to generate original insights and to produce new work in the field.

For example, the work:

- offers original insights into how values and identity influence and are influenced by various factors, such as historical change, class structure, family dynamics, political systems, gender roles, artistic expression, etc.;
- offers original insights into the causes and effects of historical changes in values, beliefs, and identities;
- offers original insights into the structure of belief systems and systems of identity and explain how they contribute to creating meaning in human life;
- offers original insights into the relationships between individual beliefs and identities and those of progressively larger groups (families, communities, polities, regions, the globe);
- offers original insights into the relationships (historical connections, analogies, points of agreement and possible conflict, etc.) between the student's own beliefs and sense of identity, and those of others.

Outcome 3

Describe the impact of global interdependence on local cultures including those within the United States.

Revision: Examples do not refer to historical events. For example, colonialism is clearly relevant here; the descriptions should mention that and other equally important historical instances.

Critique of outcome 3: As with outcome 6, the causality here all flows one way. Global awareness includes an understanding of how local cultures affect global trends as well as vice-versa.

Basic factual knowledge

Student work demonstrates basic factual knowledge required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level is foundational or descriptive, or answers the questions who, what, where, and when. It also includes terminology and definitions.

For example, the work:

- identifies and/or describes global trends in music, fashion, diet, and other aspects of popular culture;
- identifies and/or describes various local cultures, in the US and the rest of the world, that affect and are affected by global trends
- identifies and/or describes global trade agreements such as WTO, NAFTA, and CAFTA;

- identifies and/or describes local laws and regulations that have been or could be affected by global agreements;
- identifies and/or describes nations with global or regional influence, and the local cultures that affect and are affected by them;
- identifies and/or describes important conflicts (wars, civil unrest, terrorism, resource disputes, etc.) that affect religious freedom, resource use and availability, and perceptions of other cultures
- defines key terms used in the study of these issues.

Contextual Knowledge and Understanding

Student work demonstrates contextual knowledge and understanding required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level includes understanding of basic historical, evolutionary, or developmental processes, simple relationships, levels of scale, and relative position.

For example, the work:

- describes global trends in music, fashion, diet, and other aspects of popular culture, placing them in contemporary and historical context;
- describes various local cultures, in the US and the rest of the world, that affect and are affected by global trends, placing them in contemporary and historical context;
- describes global trade agreements such as WTO, NAFTA, and CAFTA, placing them in contemporary and historical context;
- describes local laws and regulations that have been could be affected by global trade agreements, placing them in contemporary and historical context;
- identifies and/or describes nations with global or regional influence, and the local cultures that affect and are affected by them;
- describes important conflicts (wars, civil unrest, terrorism, resource disputes, etc.) that affect religious freedom, resource use and availability, and perceptions of other cultures, placing them in contemporary and historical context.

Analysis

Student work analyzes complex phenomena and relationships that characterize this field of study.

Learning at this level includes understanding of complex processes and relationships, use of complex reasoning, and the ability to answer why and how questions.

For example, the work:

- analyzes global trends in music, fashion, diet, and other aspects of popular culture, explaining how they influence and are influenced by local cultures;
- analyzes global trade agreements such as WTO, NAFTA, and CAFTA, including the forces that shape such agreements and their effects on local laws and regulations;
- analyzes how conflicts (wars, civil unrest, terrorism, resource disputes, etc.) affect and are shaped by factors such as religious freedom, resource use and availability, and perceptions of other cultures;

- explores analogies to comparable phenomena in other contexts, both within the same culture and from other cultures.

Synthesis and Integration

This is in progress—still needs work.

Student work synthesizes and integrates all the foregoing levels, from basic factual knowledge to complex analysis...

Learning at this level includes the ability to generate original insights and to produce new work in the field.

For example, the work:

- generates new insights into global trends in music, fashion, diet, and other aspects of popular culture, and how they influence and are influenced by local cultures;
- generates new insights into global trade agreements such as WTO, NAFTA, and CAFTA, the forces that shape them, and their effects on local laws and regulations;
- generates new insights into how conflicts (wars, civil unrest, terrorism, resource disputes, etc.) affect and are shaped by factors such as religious freedom, resource use and availability, and perceptions of other cultures.

Outcome 4

Identify the origin of events that have led to contemporary global conflict, competition, and cooperation.

Basic factual knowledge

Student work demonstrates basic factual knowledge required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level is foundational or descriptive, or answers the questions who, what, where, and when. It also includes terminology and definitions.

For example, the work:

- Identifies and/or describes different economic, social, and political systems, including their internal and external conditions
- Identifies and/or describes international institutions, governments, and organizations
- Identifies and/or describes historical events that have led to contemporary global conflict, competition, and cooperation.

Contextual Knowledge and Understanding

Student work demonstrates contextual knowledge and understanding required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level includes understanding of basic historical, evolutionary, or developmental processes, simple relationships, levels of scale, and relative position.

For example, the work:

- Describes the historical development of different economic, social, and political systems, including their internal and external conditions
- Describes the contemporary context, including relative size and position, of different economic, social, and political systems
- Describes the historical development of international institutions, governments, and organizations
- Describes the contemporary context, including relative size and position, of international institutions, governments, and organizations
- Describes the historical background of events that have led to contemporary global conflict, competition, and cooperation
- Describes the contemporary significance and relative importance of events that have led to conflict, competition, and cooperation

Analysis

Student work analyzes complex phenomena and relationships that characterize this field of study.

Learning at this level includes understanding of complex processes and relationships, use of complex reasoning, and the ability to answer why and how questions.

For example, the work:

- analyzes the historical development of economic, social, and political systems, including their internal and external conditions, explaining causes and assessing their relative significance;
- analyzes the contemporary context of economic, social, and political systems, including causes and effects, processes, and analogous cases;
- analyzes the historical development of international institutions, governments, and organizations, explaining causes and assessing their relative significance;
- analyzes the contemporary context of international institutions, governments, and organizations, including causes and effects, processes, and analogous cases;
- analyzes the historical background of events that have led to contemporary global conflict, competition, and cooperation, assessing the causal chains that led to key events;
- analyzes the contemporary impact of events that have led to conflict, competition, and cooperation;
- explores analogies to comparable phenomena in other contexts, both within the same culture and from other cultures.

Synthesis and Integration

This is in progress—still needs work.

Student work synthesizes and integrates all the foregoing levels, from basic factual knowledge to complex analysis...

Learning at this level includes the ability to generate original insights and to produce new work in the field.

For example, the work:

- proposes new insights into the role and significance of different economic, social, and political systems, including their internal and external conditions and outcomes
- proposes new insights into the role and significance of international institutions, governments, and organizations
- proposes new insights into the historical events that have led to contemporary global conflict, competition, and cooperation.

Outcome 5

Demonstrate awareness and knowledge of the economic forces that have led to the interdependence of national economies and the imbalance of distribution of wealth.

Critique of Outcomes 3-5: There is a lot of overlap between these three outcomes, suggesting that a more over-arching outcome could be substituted for all of them. This problem would go away if we substituted a thematic or learning domain framework for our current general list framework.

Proposal: Given that a revision of the official outcomes is not going to happen in the immediate future, our assessment working group should have a way of dealing with this overlap. I propose that we treat these three outcomes as variations on a single, over-arching outcome, and decide on an ad-hoc basis which one's language is appropriate for evaluating individual work. This would avoid the redundancy of using all the descriptors from all three outcomes, as well as the opposite problem of trying to shoehorn all work into a single one of the outcomes.

Basic factual knowledge

Student work demonstrates basic factual knowledge required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level is foundational or descriptive, or answers the questions who, what, where, and when. It also includes terminology and definitions.

For example, the work:

- identifies and describes the methods and measures used in assessing economic activity
- defines key terms used in the analysis of economic activity
- identifies and describes the key social-political-economic institutions and ideologies that are the focus of economic analysis
- identifies national economies that have a significant impact on the global economic system
- identifies and describes key technological developments that have affected economic life
- identifies and describes key issues of resource value and availability
- identifies and describes key factors in geopolitical dynamics

Contextual Knowledge and Understanding

Student work demonstrates contextual knowledge and understanding required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level includes understanding of basic historical, evolutionary, or developmental processes, simple relationships, levels of scale, and relative position.

For example, the work:

- correctly uses economic methods and measures appropriate to their context and the subject of the analysis
- describes the historical development of social-political-economic systems, institutions, and ideologies
- describes the contemporary context of social-political-economic systems
- describes the role of and impacts from the interaction of technology, resource value, and availability
- describes the interaction between technology, resource value, and geopolitical dynamics

Analysis

Student work analyzes complex phenomena and relationships that characterize this field of study.

Learning at this level includes understanding of complex processes and relationships, use of complex reasoning, and the ability to answer why and how questions.

For example, the work:

- effectively uses appropriate economic methods and measures to analyze economic activity
- analyzes the historical development of social-political-economic systems, institutions, and ideologies
- analyzes the role of and impacts from the interaction of technology, resource value and availability
- analyzes the interaction between technology, resource value, and geopolitical dynamics.

Synthesis and Integration

This is in progress—still needs work.

Student work synthesizes and integrates all the foregoing levels, from basic factual knowledge to complex analysis...

Learning at this level includes the ability to generate original insights and to produce new work in the field.

For example, the work:

Outcome 6

Demonstrate knowledge of the impact of global interdependence on the natural world.

Critique of outcome #6: Outcome as stated focuses on human interconnectedness and its impact on natural world. Suggested change in wording to recognize the importance and complexity of natural systems in their own right, as well as bidirectional causality (influence of environment on humans and

vice versa). Implication is to master an understanding of these systems and the relationship with humans.

Basic factual knowledge

Student work demonstrates basic factual knowledge required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level is foundational or descriptive, or answers the questions who, what, where, and when. It also includes terminology and definitions.

For example, the work:

- identifies key physical and biological processes that operate in systems and cycles on a regional and global scale;
- identifies the types of human activities that impact global natural processes;
- identifies impacts of unsustainable use of Earth's resources and the disruption of Earth's systems and cycles;
- identifies different cultural and socio-economic priorities that result in unsustainable resource use and natural system disruptions;
- identifies solutions that can mitigate anthropogenic impacts on global processes and systems;
- correctly uses and/or defines key terms in the analysis of these topics.

Contextual Knowledge and Understanding

Student work demonstrates contextual knowledge and understanding required for competency in this field.

Learning at this level includes understanding of basic historical, evolutionary, or developmental processes, simple relationships, levels of scale, and relative position.

For example, the work:

- describes the physical and biological processes that operate in systems and cycles on a regional and global scale;
- describes the relationships between global systems and smaller subsystems;
- describes relationships between different types of systems (e.g. between hydrosphere and biosphere);
- describes the development of physical and biological processes over time;
- describes human activities that impact global natural processes, including their interactions and relative significance;
- describes the impacts from the unsustainable use of Earth's resources and the disruption of Earth's systems and cycles, including secondary impacts and effects on other systems;
- describes the different cultural and socio-economic priorities that result in unsustainable resource use and natural system disruptions, including their relative position and significance;
- describes solutions that can mitigate the anthropogenic impacts on global processes and systems, their relative feasibility, and relation to existing systems and processes.

Analysis

Student work analyzes complex phenomena and relationships that characterize this field of study.

Learning at this level includes understanding of complex processes and relationships, use of complex reasoning, and the ability to answer why and how questions.

For example, the work:

- explains physical and biological processes that operate on a regional and global scale;
- explains how different human activities impact global natural processes, and how this affects human beings and the natural world;
- explains how certain cultural and socio-economic priorities result in unsustainable natural system disruptions;
- explains how potential solutions to mitigate anthropogenic impacts work, and assesses their relative feasibility.

Synthesis and Integration

This is in progress—still needs work.

Student work synthesizes and integrates all the foregoing levels, from basic factual knowledge to complex analysis...

Learning at this level includes the ability to generate original insights and to produce new work in the field.

For example, the work: